



Issue: AZ Education

## K-12 Education in Arizona

### Arizona Voters Want a Better Education System

Arizona voters have long considered education funding to be among the top issues facing the state. A recent survey conducted in May 2022 by HighGround Public Affairs on behalf of Education Forward Arizona, a statewide nonprofit organization, revealed that voters believe it is essential to improve the state's education system as a means of improving both "the economy and quality of life for all Arizonans."<sup>1</sup> The top finding on the Arizona Voters' Agenda is "Ensuring that Arizona schools have quality teachers and principals," a topic supported by 97% of likely voters, including 98% of Democrats, 96% of Republicans, and 95% of Independents.<sup>2</sup>

Voters are concerned about the ongoing teacher shortage, the lack of qualified teachers in many classrooms, low teacher salaries, and underfunded schools.<sup>3</sup> According to Rich Nickel, President and CEO of Education Forward Arizona, "Voters ... want to see their candidates discussing and taking action on the issues that matter most to improving student outcomes."<sup>4</sup>

#### Issues Voters Support

Voters of all political parties prioritized the following actions for improving education in Arizona:

- Ensuring every school has a qualified teacher and principal
- Raising teacher pay
- Increasing school funding
- Ensuring students are proficient readers by the end of third grade
- Ensuring students are proficient in math by eighth grade
- Creating more opportunities for career and technical education
- Providing funding for additional resources for low-income students, including tutoring, counseling, transportation, extra meal services, dental and health screenings
- Increasing the number of school counselors<sup>5</sup>

#### Issues Voters Do Not Support

The survey also showed that a majority of likely Arizona voters **do not** support the following issues:

- Banning critical race theory
- Banning discussions of gender identity and sexual orientation during sex education
- Closing failing schools<sup>6</sup>

### Arizona's Dire Education Statistics

A majority of voters surveyed (68%) by HighGround Public Affairs believe that education in Arizona is heading in the wrong direction.<sup>7</sup> The data bears this out. Arizona is:

- 43rd in the nation in teacher salaries<sup>8</sup>
- 50<sup>th</sup> in amount spent on instruction<sup>9</sup>
- 48<sup>th</sup> in per-student funding<sup>10</sup>
- 49<sup>th</sup> in class size<sup>11</sup>

These statistics are not equal across all of Arizona's schools.<sup>12</sup> Inequitable funding has the greatest negative impact on low-income students, rural students, and students of color.<sup>13</sup>

As a result of the Republican Legislature's refusal over many years to adequately fund education, Arizona's teachers are forced to assume the roles that should be filled by counselors and social workers—and since COVID—by safety and health officials.<sup>14</sup> In addition, although they earn so little that their own children qualify for free or reduced lunches, Arizona's teachers spend their own money to buy paper, books, and mousetraps for their classrooms. They use textbooks that are older than they are. Their students sit at broken desks, using 22-year-old computers, held together with duct tape, in rooms with leaky ceilings.<sup>15</sup>

## Low Teacher Pay Means High Teacher Vacancy

Arizona has among the highest teacher turnover rate and vacancy rate in the country, attested to by the following statistics:

- 19% turnover rate—more than double the 8% national rate<sup>16</sup>
- 31% teacher vacancy rate as of January 2022<sup>17</sup>
- 42% of teachers leave within 3 years<sup>18</sup>
- 47.7% of vacant teacher positions are filled by “emergency teachers” who do not meet state certification requirements<sup>19</sup>

As with funding, teacher shortages are greatest in low-income and rural areas and have the greatest impact on Black, Brown, Native American, special education, and English language learning students.<sup>20</sup>

In January 2022, the authors of the semi-annual Arizona School Personnel Administrators Association survey exhorted Arizona's leaders to address the teacher shortage and to “make a collective effort to ensure the recruitment and retention of effective teachers through increased funding.”<sup>21</sup> The survey concludes that a “highly educated and skilled workforce are cornerstones to a growing and thriving economy.”<sup>22</sup>

## Low Student Performance

Teachers have the greatest “school-related influence” on students' academic achievement and economic success. This was the finding of a 2010 study led by Harvard economist Raj Chetty.<sup>23</sup> Victoria Theisen-Homer, Ph.D., author of “Learning to Connect: Relationships, Race and Teacher Education, maintains that “without a steady cohort of good teachers, students' academic and emotional growth suffer. This will ultimately impact the health of our state.”<sup>24</sup>

According to data in the Arizona Education Progress Meter, the percent of 3<sup>rd</sup> graders who scored proficient on the AZERIT English Language Arts Assessment has dropped from 46% to 35% since 2020. In the same time period, the percent of 8<sup>th</sup> graders prepared for success in high school math dropped from 41% to 27%.<sup>25</sup>

Overcrowded classrooms and a lack of resources, resulting in a poor learning environment, also contribute to low achievement for Arizona's students. This has a particularly strong impact on low-income students who, when they are able to attend better funded schools, “are more likely to complete high school and have higher earnings and lower poverty rates in adulthood.”<sup>26</sup>

The pandemic has exacerbated Arizona's educational challenges. In the past year, 55,000 students have left public schools; only 18,000 have returned, the majority enrolling in charter and online schools. This means there are as many as 37,000 students in Arizona who are not getting an education.<sup>27</sup>

## FY23 Education Funding

### K-12 Funding

With a \$5.3 billion surplus, Arizona's legislators passed a \$1 billion education budget, which represents \$526 million in new K-12 funding.<sup>28</sup> One potential obstacle to releasing the money is the state's aggregate expenditure limit, "a spending cap on school monies added to the Arizona Constitution by voters in 1980." Last year, legislators temporarily suspended the limit, so that schools could access the total budgeted amount. This year, Governor Ducey is considering calling the legislature back for a special session, but this depends on the outcome of Proposition 208, a wealth tax that would have generated about \$800 million for public education. The state Supreme Court determined that the tax is unconstitutional, but, according to Chuck Essigs, director of governmental relations at the Arizona Association of School Business Officials, "they haven't issued what the other side feels is the final determination, ... [and] once that happens the governor would call a special session."<sup>29</sup>

While the FY23 education budget represents a significant increase over previous education funding, it only raises Arizona's per-pupil spending from 48<sup>th</sup> to 45<sup>th</sup> in the nation.<sup>30</sup> In addition, the legislature passed the largest voucher expansion program in the country (HB2853) which, according to the Democrats who opposed it, "would divert money from public schools and give [an advantage to] private schools [which] don't have to be transparent with the way they spend taxpayer money."<sup>31</sup>

### Universal Vouchers

The voucher program Republicans passed in 2011 provided an alternative to public school for students with disabilities and special needs. Over the past decade, legislators have added to the program, which is open to children in foster care, in military families, living on tribal reservations and attending public schools rated D or F. About 11,775 students currently participate in the voucher program.<sup>32</sup>

House Majority Leader Ben Toma (R-Peoria), sponsored the FY22 voucher expansion bill (Empowerment Scholarship Accounts—ESAs), which passed along party lines in both the House and Senate.<sup>33</sup> It will remove all restrictions so any of the 1.1 million students in public schools can get public funding to attend a private or parochial school. This includes parents who home school their children.<sup>34</sup> Families who leave the public school system and opt into the voucher program receive a debit card worth an estimated \$7,000 for educational expenses.<sup>35</sup>

### Democratic Opponents of Universal Vouchers

Democratic State Senator Christine Marsh tried to add an amendment that the Republicans refused to consider.<sup>36</sup> It included student assessments, employee background checks, and demographic tracking.<sup>37</sup>

"We have no financial transparency, and we have no academic transparency," Marsh said. "I'd like to know how many families that earn maybe a million dollars a year are getting voucher money versus how many families earning maybe 30 or 40,000 a year are getting voucher money."<sup>38</sup>

Bill sponsor, Toma, countered that parents are the "ultimate authority. They know what's best for their children, and we should trust them to do the right thing."<sup>39</sup>

In its June 13, 2022 newsletter, Save Our Schools Arizona (SOS Arizona) decried the state's "mammoth private school voucher expansion [that] ... will siphon hundreds of millions of dollars from ... public schools every year" and "offer zero accountability or transparency for ... public taxpayer dollars."<sup>40</sup>

According to Tempe educator, Rodrigo Palacios, this "voter-opposed voucher expansion ... flies in the face of the will of Arizonans and the needs of our families."<sup>41</sup>

"It's very easy to set up a one-room shop in a strip mall," says Beth Lewis, director of Save Our Schools Arizona. It's easy to "give every kid a Chromebook and a plaid skirt, tell parents they're on an accelerated curriculum and take that \$7,000, but it's equally easy for those schools to close up shop whenever they want."<sup>42</sup>

Former Arizona House Rep. Diego Rodriguez tweeted, "The Republican universal voucher system is designed to kill public education. OUR nation's greatness is built on free Public schools. The GOP goal is to recreate segregation, expand the opportunity gap, and destroy the foundation of our democracy."<sup>43</sup>

### Republicans Celebrate Universal Vouchers

In his January 2022 State of the State address, Governor Ducey asked the legislature to pass bills that would "expand school choice any way we can."<sup>44</sup> When he signed the bill into law, he claimed Arizona had "set the gold standard in educational freedom."<sup>45</sup>

Arizona's conservative Goldwater Institute, a libertarian think tank and a driving force behind the voter expansion bill, hailed universal vouchers as a "major victory for families wary of a one-size-fits-all approach to education." They also pointed out that it would save money, since parents would receive \$7,000 under the voucher plan, which is \$4,000 less than Arizona's 45<sup>th</sup> in the nation per-pupil public school funding.<sup>46</sup>

Manhattan Institute fellow and anti-critical race theory activist Christopher Rufo tweeted, "Every red state in the country should follow [Ducey's] lead," since the law "gives every family a right to exit any public school that fails to educate their children or reflect their values."<sup>47</sup>

Corey DeAngelis, research director of American Federation for Children, Betsy DeVos' school privatization lobby group, tweeted that Arizona "just took first place" when it comes to school choice.<sup>48</sup>

### Anti-Voucher Voter Initiative

In 2018, a grass root group of parents and educators launched a campaign against a less comprehensive bill and were able to bring the issue to the voters who soundly defeated it, with 65% voting against expanded vouchers.<sup>49</sup> According to Beth Lewis, executive director of Save Our Schools Arizona (SOS Arizona), signature gathering has already begun for petitions to bring the latest voucher expansion bill to the voters in November.<sup>50</sup>

In an effort to weaken Arizona's citizen initiative process, the Republican-controlled legislature passed a referendum (HCR2015) that will appear on the November 8<sup>th</sup> ballot, asking voters to "require that all initiatives and referenda that include a tax component (such as funding for public education) pass with a 60% supermajority of voters."<sup>51</sup>



## More Republican-Backed Legislation

See the Appendix for additional bills the Republicans proposed during the FY22 legislative session.

## A Commitment to Quality Education for Arizona's Students

There is a stark disconnect in Arizona between the Republican-controlled legislature, which has consistently underfunded the state's schools, and the voting public who consider education funding to be one of the top issues facing the state. As a result of years of tax cuts, and voter expansion measures Arizona's K-12 education system is in a sorry state of disrepair: low teacher pay, teacher shortages, overcrowded classrooms, and poor resources all make it extremely difficult for many of Arizona's students to receive a quality education. This is especially true for low-income and special needs students.

Rich Nickel, President and CEO of Education Forward Arizona, offers the following advice to candidates for the state legislature: "It's clear that voters want to see candidates prioritizing and offering solutions to address our teacher shortage, to help our kids learn key subjects and ensure they have opportunities to pursue pathways that lead to education attainment and good careers."<sup>52</sup>

Save Our Schools Arizona (SOS Arizona) says, "We know that strong public schools build a strong state." ... "On November 8, we are asking our fellow Arizona voters to elect a legislature that will commit to prioritizing and funding public education."<sup>53</sup>

## Appendix

The Republican-controlled legislature passed the following bills that will have a negative impact on Arizona's teachers and students. All of the descriptions below come straight from Save Our Schools Arizona's June 23, 2022 Weekly Education Report.<sup>54</sup>

- **HB2495**, Hoffman (R-12), bans students from using "sexually explicit" material in public school, but that is loosely enough defined to include physical contact with someone's buttock. The bill was amended down to allow books that "possess serious educational, literary, artistic, political or scientific value for minors" (which is subjective and undefined) and requires written parental consent for each instance.
- **SB1159**, Gray (R-21), allows anyone who completes any teacher prep program to receive a Standard Teaching Certificate and expands "subject matter expert" teaching to grades as young as kindergarten. This furthers the misconception that anyone can teach, and that it is not necessary to be trained in curriculum, classroom management or instruction.

The legislature did not take up the following bills or the bills did not pass, but they demonstrate the Republican legislators' attempts to undermine Arizona's teachers and curriculum:

- **SB1269** Udall (R-25) was a last-minute move to rig the school funding formula to increase the disparity between wealthy and impoverished schools. Early estimates say roughly half of school districts in Arizona would lose money. Never heard on the House floor.
- **HB2233** Udall (R-25) was a last-minute striker to once again revive school takeover bill **HB2808** (previously revived as **HB2284**). The proposal forces public school takeovers based on their performance on standardized testing, which hurts local communities, instead of identifying resources for the low-income students that need it most. Amended down to remove the school closure pieces, then failed spectacularly, on the Senate floor.
- **HB2278**, Livingston (R-22), would have expanded School Tuition Organization (STO) vouchers and allowed STO voucher companies to collude to give students multiple vouchers. FAILED Senate floor, 6/23.
- **SB1211**, Barto (R-15), would have required public district and charter schools to post a list of every single item teachers use or discuss with students within days of instruction. Failed on the House floor thanks to Joel John (R-4) and all Democrats.
- **SB1412**, Udall (R-25), would have banned teaching controversial topics in schools and drive further distrust of educators. Teachers could have been disciplined up to losing their license, and school districts would have faced penalties of up to \$5,000. Went to conference committee, but never final passed by the House. Dead!



- [HCR2001, Kaiser \(R-15\), would have asked voters to amend the state constitution to include the "Stop Critical Race Theory and Racial Discrimination in Schools and Other Public Institutions Act." Never heard on the Senate floor.](#)

<sup>1</sup> <https://www.arizonafuture.org/news-events/news/2022/6/arizona-voters-agenda-voters-overwhelmingly-support-increased-education-funding-training-beyond-high-school/>

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.arizonafuture.org/news-events/news/2022/6/arizona-voters-agenda-voters-overwhelmingly-support-increased-education-funding-training-beyond-high-school/>

<sup>3</sup> <https://educationforwardarizona.org/arizona-voters-prioritize-education-over-politics-2/>

<sup>4</sup> <https://educationforwardarizona.org/arizona-voters-prioritize-education-over-politics-2/>

<sup>5</sup> <https://educationforwardarizona.org/arizona-voters-prioritize-education-over-politics-2/>

<sup>6</sup> <https://educationforwardarizona.org/arizona-voters-prioritize-education-over-politics-2/>

<sup>7</sup> <https://educationforwardarizona.org/arizona-voters-prioritize-education-over-politics-2/>

<sup>8</sup> <https://www.purefy.com/learn/what-is-the-average-teacher-salary>

<sup>9</sup> <https://cronkitenews.azpbs.org/2022/06/21/arizona-educators-rally-protest-public-school>

<sup>10</sup> <https://cronkitenews.azpbs.org/2022/06/21/arizona-educators-rally-protest-public-school>

<sup>11</sup> <https://sosarizona.org/az-k12-funding/>

<sup>12</sup> <https://ywcaaz.org/the-effects-of-the-teacher-shortage-in-arizona/>

<sup>13</sup> <https://sosarizona.org/az-k12-funding/>

<sup>14</sup> <https://cronkitenews.azpbs.org/2022/02/15/arizona-schools-faces-teacher-shortage/>

<sup>15</sup> <https://www.arizonaaea.org/redford>

<sup>16</sup> <https://ywcaaz.org/the-effects-of-the-teacher-shortage-in-arizona/>

<sup>17</sup> <https://azednews.com/arizonas-severe-teacher-shortage-continues-aspaa-survey-shows/>

<sup>18</sup> <https://ywcaaz.org/the-effects-of-the-teacher-shortage-in-arizona/>

<sup>19</sup> <https://ywcaaz.org/the-effects-of-the-teacher-shortage-in-arizona/>

<sup>20</sup> <https://ywcaaz.org/the-effects-of-the-teacher-shortage-in-arizona/>

<sup>21</sup> <https://azednews.com/arizonas-severe-teacher-shortage-continues-aspaa-survey-shows/>

<sup>22</sup> <https://azednews.com/arizonas-severe-teacher-shortage-continues-aspaa-survey-shows/>

<sup>23</sup> <https://www.nytimes.com/2010/07/28/business/economy/28leonhardt.html>

<sup>24</sup> <https://www.azcentral.com/story/opinion/op-ed/2021/07/30/arizona-teacher-shortage-screams-for-graduate-teacher-residency-program/5408496001/#:~:text=Arizona%E2%80%99s%20teacher%20shortage%20is%20one%20of%20the%20worst,nationally%29.%20The%20pandemic%20has%20only%20made%20this%20worse>

<sup>25</sup> <https://educationforwardarizona.org/progress/>

<sup>26</sup> <https://azsba.org/arizonas-unrestored-budget-cuts/>

<sup>27</sup> <https://ywcaaz.org/the-effects-of-the-teacher-shortage-in-arizona/>

<sup>28</sup> <https://www.arizonaaea.org/about-aea/media-center/press-releases/aea-voices-heard-capitol>

<sup>29</sup> [https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/special-session-possible-to-avert-education-cuts/?utm\\_term=Special%20session%20possible%20to%20avert%20education%20cuts&utm\\_campaign=Vote%20on%20whether%20to%20protect%20abortion%20rights%20won%27t%20be%20on%20ballot%20in%20AZ%20this%20year&utm\\_content=email&utm\\_source=Act-On+Software&utm\\_medium=email&cm\\_mmc=Act-On%20Software-\\_-email-\\_-](https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/special-session-possible-to-avert-education-cuts/?utm_term=Special%20session%20possible%20to%20avert%20education%20cuts&utm_campaign=Vote%20on%20whether%20to%20protect%20abortion%20rights%20won%27t%20be%20on%20ballot%20in%20AZ%20this%20year&utm_content=email&utm_source=Act-On+Software&utm_medium=email&cm_mmc=Act-On%20Software-_-email-_-)

<sup>29</sup> [https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/special-session-possible-to-avert-education-cuts/?utm\\_term=Special%20session%20possible%20to%20avert%20education%20cuts&utm\\_campaign=Vote%20on%20whether%20to%20protect%20abortion%20rights%20won%27t%20be%20on%20ballot%20in%20AZ%20this%20year&utm\\_content=email&utm\\_source=Act-On+Software&utm\\_medium=email&cm\\_mmc=Act-On%20Software-\\_-email-\\_-](https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/special-session-possible-to-avert-education-cuts/?utm_term=Special%20session%20possible%20to%20avert%20education%20cuts&utm_campaign=Vote%20on%20whether%20to%20protect%20abortion%20rights%20won%27t%20be%20on%20ballot%20in%20AZ%20this%20year&utm_content=email&utm_source=Act-On+Software&utm_medium=email&cm_mmc=Act-On%20Software-_-email-_-)

<sup>29</sup> [https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/special-session-possible-to-avert-education-cuts/?utm\\_term=Special%20session%20possible%20to%20avert%20education%20cuts&utm\\_campaign=Vote%20on%20whether%20to%20protect%20abortion%20rights%20won%27t%20be%20on%20ballot%20in%20AZ%20this%20year&utm\\_content=email&utm\\_source=Act-On+Software&utm\\_medium=email&cm\\_mmc=Act-On%20Software-\\_-email-\\_-](https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/special-session-possible-to-avert-education-cuts/?utm_term=Special%20session%20possible%20to%20avert%20education%20cuts&utm_campaign=Vote%20on%20whether%20to%20protect%20abortion%20rights%20won%27t%20be%20on%20ballot%20in%20AZ%20this%20year&utm_content=email&utm_source=Act-On+Software&utm_medium=email&cm_mmc=Act-On%20Software-_-email-_-)

<sup>30</sup> [https://docs.google.com/document/d/e/2PACX-1vRll6n-AkB7dErpIyuq9jkv4TGKIWRHL629PdlhoU6stUNRX7TQj0R4m\\_b\\_DoJkavMjM2AP18MopvEY/pub](https://docs.google.com/document/d/e/2PACX-1vRll6n-AkB7dErpIyuq9jkv4TGKIWRHL629PdlhoU6stUNRX7TQj0R4m_b_DoJkavMjM2AP18MopvEY/pub)

<sup>31</sup> <https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/06/25/legislature-passes-biggest-esa-expansion-in-country/>

<sup>32</sup> <https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/ducey-approves-controversial-private-parochial-school-vouchers/>

<sup>33</sup> <https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/06/25/legislature-passes-biggest-esa-expansion-in-country/>

<sup>34</sup> <https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/ducey-approves-controversial-private-parochial-school-vouchers/>

<sup>35</sup> <https://www.12news.com/article/news/local/arizona/arizona-school-voucher-law-passes-with-no-accountability-measures/75-a4f59777-e11d-407c-86d1-b3aab8c54e63>

<sup>36</sup> <https://www.12news.com/article/news/local/arizona/arizona-school-voucher-law-passes-with-no-accountability-measures/75-a4f59777-e11d-407c-86d1-b3aab8c54e63>

<sup>37</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>38</sup> <https://www.12news.com/article/news/local/arizona/arizona-school-voucher-law-passes-with-no-accountability-measures/75-a4f59777-e11d-407c-86d1-b3aab8c54e63>

<sup>39</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>40</sup> [https://docs.google.com/document/d/e/2PACX-1vTojGDbyGgxs\\_337-SWbt1fgDTR18kk3dsIa0Esqb0dEGv-jxSTDBcX5jgfr8NMarHqZqzgnUWTuGs9/pub](https://docs.google.com/document/d/e/2PACX-1vTojGDbyGgxs_337-SWbt1fgDTR18kk3dsIa0Esqb0dEGv-jxSTDBcX5jgfr8NMarHqZqzgnUWTuGs9/pub)

<sup>41</sup> <https://kjzz.org/content/1788091/republicans-again-propose-universal-school-vouchers-11-million-arizona-students>

<sup>42</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>43</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>44</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>45</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>46</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>47</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>48</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>49</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>50</sup> <https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2022/07/07/ducey-approves-controversial-private-parochial-school-vouchers/>

<sup>51</sup> <https://www.salon.com/2022/07/01/schools-out-forever-arizona-moves-to-public-education-with-new-universal-voucher-law/?emci=cbl360c-52fa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&emdi=fceaf7b6-5afa-ec11-b47a-281878b83d8a&ceid=8992262>

<sup>52</sup> <https://educationforwardarizona.org/arizona-voters-prioritize-education-over-politics-2/>

<sup>53</sup> <https://sosarizona.org/vote4publiced/legislativecandidates/>

<sup>54</sup> [https://docs.google.com/document/d/e/2PACX-1vRll6n-AkB7dErpIyuq9jkv4TGKIWRHL629PdlhoU6stUNRX7TQj0R4m\\_b\\_DoJkavMjM2AP18MopvEY/pub](https://docs.google.com/document/d/e/2PACX-1vRll6n-AkB7dErpIyuq9jkv4TGKIWRHL629PdlhoU6stUNRX7TQj0R4m_b_DoJkavMjM2AP18MopvEY/pub)